

Minutes of the Meeting of Technical Evaluation Committee for Medical Equipment, Tender No. BMSICL/2018-19/ME-110, held on 26th April 2019 at Conference hall of BMSICL Patna

1. Attendance - As per the attendance register
2. The equipment wise/firm wise evaluation sheets of technical bids for tender no-BMSICL/2018-19/ME-110 prepared with the help of SRU/TE, were uploaded on the website of BMSICL vide letter no- BMSIC/45025/117-2018/5376 dated:- 06.02.2019 for clarification/objection, if any, as per the recommendation of technical committee in TEC meeting held on 01/02/2019.
3. As per the request from the concerned firms, the last date of submission of claim/ objections sought vide letter no-BMSIC/45025/117-2018/5376 dated: - 06.02.2019 was extended up to 12/03/2019.
4. A comparative chart of clarifications/objections received from the bidders was prepared with the help of SRU/ TE and were examined by the committee in today's meeting and the observations were recorded, which is annexed as Annexure-I (Total pages- 62)
5. The major point of the recorded observations found by the committee are as following:-

Sl. no	Description	M/s L& T Pvt. Ltd, Chennai	M/s Apollo Hospital Pvt. Ltd, Chennai	Remarks
1.	Quality Certificate			
	(A) USFDA	Out of all the 312 main/ major items the firm will supply 135 nos. of USFDA Certified Equipment	Out of all the 312 main/ major items the firm will supply 116 nos. of USFDA Certified Equipment	
		In case of 22 major equipment, USFDA Certified equipment are not offered by L & T while its counterpart bidder Apollo is providing USFDA Certified equipment for the same items.	In case of 41 major equipment, USFDA Certified equipment are not offered by Apollo while its counterpart bidder L & T is providing USFDA Certified equipment for the same items.	
	(B) CE	163 numbers CE Certified items.	155 numbers CE Certified items.	1. (For L&T) Searching for few equipment randomly for these CE certified quoted items on USFDA website for registered medical device database it

				<p>appeared that approx. 39 nos. of equipment are USFDA certified available but bidder has offered CE certified items. Which is contradicting to ITB clause -2- standard as on page- no.-25 of the bid document Further these numbers could be more.</p> <p>2. (For Appolo): Searching for few equipment randomly for these CE certified quoted items on USFDA website for registered medical device database it appeared that approx. 29 nos. of equipments are USFDA certified available but bidder has offered CE certified items. Which is contradicting to ITB clause -2- standard as on page- no.-25 of the bid document. Further these numbers could be more.</p>
	(C) ISO/BIS	8 numbers of ISO/BIS certified items.	33 numbers of ISO/BIS certified items.	
	(D) Not submitted	Not submitted any quality declaration of 6 numbers of items	Not submitted any quality declaration of 8 numbers of items	
2	Make & Model changing after clarification	After clarification it is found that 49 numbers of major items are of entirely different make	No change in make & model by the bidder after clarification.	Bidder L&T is contradiction with ITB Clause 6 of Bid Document

		& model other than make & model quoted in online bid.		
3	Technical Deviation	Out of 25 major items, there is technical deviation for two items (manual rotatory microtome & fully automated immune-histo-chemistry set up.) Technical deviation is not submitted for remaining 23 items in line with MCI guidelines of the bid documents.	36 major items are technically deviated in comparison to technical specification published in bid documents.	

6. During the evaluation of clarification received from the bidders, it is found that the bidder has not submitted the explanation/clarification for non availability of USFDA certified equipments in that category as well as acceptance of make & model which are not mentioned in online bid document for 49 types of item.
7. The clarification /objection received from the bidders were examined by the committee in today's meeting and it was found that the clarification given by most of them are not supported by documentary evidence. Hence it was decided to recommend that these bidders should be given the time of 4 days to submit documentary evidence. The meeting was thus concluded with vote of thanks.

Sd/-
(Sh. Navindra Kumar)
DGM (Equipment),
BMSICL

Sd/-
Dr. N.k Mishra
Additional Director,
Dept. of Health, Govt. of Bihar

Sd/-
(Sh. Sunil Kumar Singh)
GM (Procurement), BMSICL

Sd/-
(Sh. Rajanikant)
CGM (Supply Chain), BMSICL

Sd/-
(Sh. Khalid Arshad)
A.O. SHSB, Patna

Sd/-
(Sh. Anil Kumar)
Joint Secretary,
Dept. of Health, Govt. of Bihar

Sd/-
(Dr. R.D Ranjan)
Director in Chief,
Dept. of Health, Govt. of Bihar